

2 Cooper Street, 45 Wentworth Road & 18A Cooper Street, Strathfield

July 2016

urbis

URBIS STAFF RESPONSIBLE FOR THIS REPORT WERE:

Director	Stephen Davies, B Arts Dip. Ed., Dip. T&CP, Dip. Cons. Studies	
Associate Director	Fiona Binns, B Arts, M Arts (Curatorial Studies)	
Consultant	Alicia Vickers, B Des (Architecture), M Heritage and Conservation	
Job Code	SH592	
	01 Draft 20 July 2016	
Report Number	02 Final 26 July 2016	

© Urbis Pty Ltd ABN 50 105 256 228

All Rights Reserved. No material may be reproduced without prior permission.

You must read the important disclaimer appearing within the body of this report.

URBIS Australia Asia Middle East urbis.com.au

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Execu	ecutive Summaryii		
1	Introduction	3	
1.1	Background	3	
1.2	Site Location	3	
1.3	Methodology	4	
1.4	Limitations	4	
1.5	Author Identification	4	
2	Site Description	5	
2.1	The Subject Site	5	
2.1.1	2 Cooper Street, Strathfield	7	
2.1.2	45 Wentworth Road, Strathfield		
2.1.3	18A Cooper Street, Strathfield	12	
3	Historical Overview		
3.1	Area History	15	
3.2	Site History		
3.2.1	2 Cooper Street		
3.2.2	18A Cooper Street		
3.2.3	45 Wentworth Road		
3.3	Dates of Construction	30	
4	Comparative Analysis—18A Cooper Street, Strathfield		
4.1	Comparative Analysis Table		
4.1.1	Comparative Analysis Summary	36	
5	Heritage Significance		
5.1	What is Heritage Significance?		
5.2	Significance Assessment—2 Cooper Street, Strathfield		
5.2.1	Statement of Significance-2 Cooper Street, Strathfield	40	
5.3	Significance Assessment—45 Wentworth Road, Strathfield		
5.3.1	Statement of Significance—45 Wentworth Road, Strathfield		
5.4	Significance Assessment—18A Cooper Street, Strathfield		
5.4.1	Statement of Significance—18A Cooper Street, Strathfield	45	
6	Opportunities and Constraints		
6.1	Heritage legislation		
6.2	Opportunities	46	
6.3	Constraints	46	
7	Conclusion and Recommendations	47	
8	Bibliography and References		
8.1	Bibliography		
8.2	References	48	
Discla	imer	49	

FIGURES:

Figure 1 – Proposed block for re-zoning (Blue) with existing heritage listed items identified (Red).	4
Figure 2 – Aerial view of sites 2 Cooper Street and 45 Wentworth Road, Strathfield	5

PICTURES:

Picture 1 – Principal northern façade	. 7
Picture 2 – External view of infilled western façade.	
Picture 3 – External view of eastern bay.	
Picture 4 – Detail eastern bay	. 7
Picture 5 – External view of western façade	. 8
Picture 6 – External view of rear southern façade	. 8
Picture 7 – Internal view of principal room	. 8
Picture 8 – Internal view of principal room and timber joinery	. 8
Picture 9 – Internal view of skirting	. 8
Picture 10 – Internal view of timber fireplace	. 8
Picture 11 – Internal view of corridor	
Picture 12 – Internal view showing dilapidated ceiling.	. 9
Picture 13 – Internal view of existing infilled western verandah	. 9
Picture 14 – Internal view of existing later kitchen fitout in rear wing	. 9
Picture 15 – Principal eastern façade	10
Picture 16 – Principal eastern façade	10
Picture 17 – Detail lower ground level front façade	10

Picture 18 – Northern façade	10
Picture 19 – External view	
Picture 20 – Internal view	11
Picture 21 – External view	11
Picture 22 – Internal view	
Picture 23 – Principal front	13
Picture 24 – Front fence	
Picture 25 – External view of front of dwelling	13
Picture 26 – External view of front of dwelling	13
Picture 27 – External view of rear of dwelling	13
Picture 28 – External view of rear of dwelling	
Picture 29 – Internal view	14
Picture 30 – Internal view	14
Picture 31 – Internal view	
Picture 32 – Internal view	14
Picture 33 – Internal view	14
Picture 34 – Internal view	14

Executive Summary

Urbis has been engaged by the residents of the south side of Cooper Street, to prepare the following Heritage Assessment for the subject buildings located at 2 Cooper Street, 45 Wentworth Road and 18A Cooper Street, Strathfield.

The subject buildings form part of a larger precinct, being the residential block of land located between Cooper Lane and Wentworth Road, Strathfield, which contains 12 properties (located on the southern side of Cooper Street) and is proposed for re-zoning to provide for higher density development. A separate Heritage Impact Statement (HIS) report will be prepared to accompany the submission of the planning proposal.

The subject buildings are Local heritage listed items on Burwood Local Environment Plan (LEP) 2012, identified as *"Victorian House"* (item 1190) located at 2 Cooper Street, Strathfield, *"Victorian Villa"* (item 1207), located at 45 Wentworth Road, Strathfield and *"1950s House and Garden"* (item 1192) located at 18A Cooper Street, Strathfield. The substation located at 2B Cooper Street is also listed on the Ausgrid S170 Register, identified as *"Electricity Substation No.308"*, but it remains in separate ownership and does not form part of the subject proposal.

The subject block does not form part of a heritage conservation area; however, residential development on the northern side of Cooper Street forms part of two heritage conservation areas, identified as "*The Mosely and Roberts Streets Heritage Conservation Area*" (item C15) and the "*Philip Street Heritage Conservation Area*" (item C16). These conservation areas comprise of a range of high quality and consistent dwellings from the late nineteenth to the early twentieth century.

The following heritage assessment has been provided to assess the significance of the nominated heritage items within the site and to outline the opportunities and constraints for the subject buildings in the context of the proposed re-zoning of the subject block for future residential flat development.

Urbis has previously undertaken a Heritage Peer Review of the subject buildings in March 2015 and found that 45 Wentworth Avenue should be retained. This study supersedes our previous assessment and incorporates more detailed research with regard to 2 Cooper Street and 18A Cooper Street.

This report has found that 2 Cooper Street and 45 Wentworth Road reach the threshold for Local heritage listing and should be retained and conserved in any future planning proposal for the site. Furthermore, this report has found that 18A Cooper Street does not reach the threshold for Local heritage listing and is recommended to be removed from the LEP.

1 Introduction

1.1 BACKGROUND

Urbis has been engaged by the residents of the south side of Cooper Street, to prepare the following Heritage Assessment for the subject buildings located at 2 Cooper Street, 45 Wentworth Road and 18A Cooper Street, Strathfield.

The subject buildings form part of a larger precinct, being the residential block of land located between Cooper Lane and Wentworth Road, Strathfield, which contains 12 properties (located on the southern side of Cooper Street) and is proposed for re-zoning to provide for higher density development. A separate Heritage Impact Statement (HIS) report will be prepared to accompany the submission of the planning proposal.

The subject buildings are Local heritage listed items on Burwood Local Environment Plan (LEP) 2012, identified as *"Victorian House"* (item 1190) located at 2 Cooper Street, Strathfield, *"Victorian Villa"* (item 1207), located at 45 Wentworth Road, Strathfield and *"1950s House and Garden"* (item 1192) located at 18A Cooper Street, Strathfield. The substation located at 2B Cooper Street is also listed on the Ausgrid S170 Register, identified as *"Electricity Substation No.308"*, but it remains in separate ownership and does not form part of the subject proposal.

The following heritage assessment has been provided to assess the significance of the nominated heritage items within the site and to outline the opportunities and constraints for the subject buildings in the context of the proposed re-zoning of the subject block for future residential flat development.

1.2 SITE LOCATION

The subject buildings form part of a larger precinct, being the residential block of land located between Cooper Lane and Wentworth Road, Strathfield, as shown in Figure 1 below:

- 2 Cooper Street, Strathfield— Lots 23–24, DP 2089 and Lot 1, DP 455342;
- 18A Cooper Street, Strathfield—Lot 1, DP 229007; and
- 45 Wentworth Road, Strathfield— Lot B, DP 33503.
- 2B Cooper Street, Strathfield—Lot 1, DP 324150

FIGURE 1 – PROPOSED BLOCK FOR RE-ZONING (BLUE) WITH EXISTING HERITAGE LISTED ITEMS IDENTIFIED (RED).



SOURCE: SIX VIEWER

1.3 METHODOLOGY

This heritage assessment has been prepared in accordance with the NSW Heritage Branch guideline 'Assessing Heritage Significance' (2001). The philosophy and process adopted is that guided by the *Australia ICOMOS Burra Charter* 2013.

Site opportunities and constraints have been considered with reference to relevant provisions and controls contained within the Burwood Local Environmental Plan (LEP) 2012 and the Burwood Development Control Plan (DCP) 2013 (amended 2015).

The assessments of significance provided in Section 4 individually assess the significance of the subject buildings.

1.4 LIMITATIONS

Internal access to 45 Wentworth Avenue was limited as the site was a fully tenanted boarding house.

1.5 AUTHOR IDENTIFICATION

The following report has been prepared by Fiona Binns (Associate Director) and Alicia Vickers (Consultant). Stephen Davies (Director) has reviewed and endorsed its content.

Unless otherwise stated, all drawings, illustrations and photographs are the work of Urbis.

2 Site Description

2.1 THE SUBJECT SITE

The subject site is located in Strathfield, in the Local Government Area (LGA) of Burwood. Strathfield is an inner west suburb of Sydney, located approximately 12km west of the Sydney Central Business District (CBD). Specifically, the subject site is located in close vicinity to Strathfield Railway Station and is on the northern side of the station.

The subject residential block is bound by Cooper Street to the north, Wentworth Road to the east, Cowdery Lane to the south and Cooper Lane to the west. The block is predominately characterised by late Victorian villas, with some early twentieth century overlay. It is also noted that the block also contains an operational late 1920s substation (located at 2B Cooper Street); however, as discussed previously, this does not form part of the subject proposal.

The block is proposed to be re-zoned for residential flat development. The subject dwellings, including 2 Cooper Street and 45 Wentworth Road, are located at the eastern end of the block and 18A is substantially separated from these two buildings and is located at the western end of the block.

The block does not form part of a heritage conservation area; however, residential development on the northern side of Cooper Street forms part of two heritage conservation areas, identified as "*The Mosely and Roberts Streets Heritage Conservation Area*" (item C15) and the "*Philip Street Heritage Conservation Area*" (item C15). These conservation areas comprise of a range of high quality and consistent dwellings from the late nineteenth to the early twentieth century.



FIGURE 2 – AERIAL VIEW OF SITES 2 COOPER STREET AND 45 WENTWORTH ROAD, STRATHFIELD

SOURCE: SIX VIEWER

FIGURE 3 – AERIAL VIEW OF SITES 2 COOPER STREET AND 45 WENTWORTH ROAD, STRATHFIELD



SOURCE: SIX VIEWER

FIGURE 4 – AERIAL VIEW OF SITE 18A COOPER STREET



SOURCE: SIX VIEWER

2.1.1 2 COOPER STREET, STRATHFIELD

Number 2 Cooper Street comprises of a single storey late Victorian villa constructed by 1890 in the Italianate style. The house is well setback from the street frontage and sits within an established garden setting, which retains some evidence of the original planting scheme.

The subject dwelling is of asymmetrical construction and comprises of rendered brick with ashlar lined finish and a tiled roof and chimneys. It comprises of a front bay to its Cooper Street facade, which features vertically proportioned timber double hung sash windows with arched window headers and stucco detailing. The bays feature hipped roofs with decorative bracketed eaves.

There are wings on either side of the bay with corrugated iron bull nosed verandahs. The eastern verandah wraps around the eastern façade and secondary bay and retains original rounded cast iron columns. The western front verandah has later FC sheet infill. The rear of the dwelling is more utilitarian, although retains the early wing configuration albeit with what appears to be an extended roof form.

The dwelling was constructed as a gentleman's residence and this is reflected in the high quality interiors; the original configuration is largely retained with large principal rooms incorporating decorative Victorian and art noveau fireplaces, timber joinery and skirtings, hallway arches and decorative ceilings (including lathe and plaster) with cornices as well as timber floors.

The dwelling is currently vacant and is not habitable due to its highly dilapidated condition, including missing and damaged ceilings, wall and floor finishes. There are also several areas where the brickwork is crumbling.

FIGURE 5 - SITE IMAGES-2 COOPER STREET, STRATHFIELD



PICTURE 1 - PRINCIPAL NORTHERN FAÇADE.





PICTURE 3 – EXTERNAL VIEW OF EASTERN BAY.

PICTURE 2 – EXTERNAL VIEW OF INFILLED WESTERN FAÇADE.



PICTURE 4 – DETAIL EASTERN BAY.



PICTURE 5 – EXTERNAL VIEW OF WESTERN FAÇADE.



PICTURE 6 – EXTERNAL VIEW OF REAR SOUTHERN FAÇADE.



PICTURE 7 – INTERNAL VIEW OF PRINCIPAL ROOM.



PICTURE 8 – INTERNAL VIEW OF PRINCIPAL ROOM AND TIMBER JOINERY.



PICTURE 9 - INTERNAL VIEW OF SKIRTING.



PICTURE 10 - INTERNAL VIEW OF TIMBER FIREPLACE.



PICTURE 11 - INTERNAL VIEW OF CORRIDOR.



PICTURE 12 – INTERNAL VIEW SHOWING DILAPIDATED CEILING.



PICTURE 13 – INTERNAL VIEW OF EXISTING INFILLED WESTERN VERANDAH.



PICTURE 14 – INTERNAL VIEW OF EXISTING LATER KITCHEN FITOUT IN REAR WING.

2.1.2 45 WENTWORTH ROAD, STRATHFIELD

Number 45 Wentworth Road comprises of a two storey substantial dwelling constructed by 1896. It is situated on a large corner block, with a principal frontage to Wentworth Road and a secondary frontage to Cowdery Lane. The dwelling retains a large established garden setting and is screened from the street by a row of mature trees along the principal Wentworth Road boundary.

The subject dwelling is masonry construction in a combination of Flemish and stretcher bonded face brick with a tiled roof. It features elements of both late Victorian and Federation styles of architecture. It features a projecting bay to its principal façade which comprises of a projecting timber clad gable, rectangular accent, with dichromatic brickwork to corners, string course and arched window headers. Its principal facade also features a highly modified two storey verandah with timber posts and metal balustrading to the upper level and brick columns and low walls to the lower level. The principal façade

features pairs of arched timber single hung windows with molded stucco detailing. The ground and first floor verandah doors feature decorative leadlight toplights and sidelights.

The side and rear facades of the dwelling are secondary facades with limited detailing; although they retain the arched timber windows. The southern façade has been painted. The rear façade comprises of an enclosed weatherboard balcony with window hoods to the lower level windows. A rear service wing extends along the north western corner of the site and appears to be of brick construction and may date from the construction of the dwelling, although with some additions. The rear of the site is paved and utilitarian. There is a separate lightweight garage structure in the south western corner of the site.

Internally, the property has been modified when it was converted into a boarding house; however, retains many of its original features including its original principal room layouts, stairs, balustrades, skirtings, architraves, doors and highlights.



FIGURE 6 - SITE IMAGES-45 WENTWORTH STREET, STRATHFIELD.

PICTURE 15 - PRINCIPAL EASTERN FAÇADE.



PICTURE 16 - PRINCIPAL EASTERN FAÇADE.



PICTURE 17 – DETAIL LOWER GROUND LEVEL FRONT FAÇADE.



PICTURE 18 - NORTHERN FAÇADE.



PICTURE 19 – EXTERNAL VIEW



PICTURE 21 – EXTERNAL VIEW



PICTURE 20 – INTERNAL VIEW



PICTURE 22 – INTERNAL VIEW

2.1.3 18A COOPER STREET, STRATHFIELD

Number 18A Cooper Street, Strathfield comprises of a two storey dwelling constructed by 1939. It is well setback from the street frontage which comprises of a large grassed front lawn area and is screened from the street by a row of mature trees along Cooper Street boundary. The front boundary also features a curved low brick front fence, wrought iron front gates and a long driveway.

The subject dwelling is of brick construction with a hipped roof. Overall, it has stripped architectural expression and detailing. However, it does have some features consistent with the Inter War Functionalist style of architecture with its curved elements, including its rounded bay window, curved horizontal balcony profile and corner elements. Other features, such as its enclosed verandah with rounded support posts, a drive through covered porch, use of blond brickwork and soldier course headers to openings, are suggestive of later 1950s domestic architecture.

The rear wing is a recent addition and comprises of a single storey structure with a low pitched roof and a side verandah. It has been constructed and detailed to match the principal dwelling. There is a double garage located to the rear boundary, which is a detached structure with a hipped roof and is a later addition. The site has been subdivided at the rear and comprises of a small block of land with a dwelling of a similar construction and style.

Internally, the site comprises of brick chimneys and timber floorboards, joinery and staircase. There is no significant detailing of note.

Condition

The subject site was assessed by United Consulting Engineers Pty Ltd. This report found that a *"substantial amount of the house would need to be reconstructed as a result of poor construction and building quality issues, in particular the front façade".*¹

The report also noted that the concrete beam which supports the curved bay and verandah shows evidence of concrete cancer, which would likely necessitate substantial reconstruction of the front façade to mitigate this. There is also substantial water ingress within the main living area potentially through the balcony slab which is contributing to the concrete cancer in the beam. There are also considerable leaks within the roof.

The report concludes that the building is showing signs of distress and will require major remedial work. The long term status of the building is at risk.



FIGURE 7 - SITE IMAGES-18A COOPER STREET, STRATHFIELD

PICTURE 23 – INTERIOR OF CURVED FRONT SECTION OF THE HOUSE



PICTURE 24 – DETAIL SHOWING CONCRETE CANCER

¹ United Consulting Engineers Pty Ltd, Structural Report—18A Cooper Street, Strathfield, May 2016, p1

FIGURE 8 - SITE IMAGES-18A COOPER STREET, STRATHFIELD



PICTURE 25 - PRINCIPAL FRONT



PICTURE 27 – EXTERNAL VIEW OF FRONT OF DWELLING



PICTURE 26 – FRONT FENCE



PICTURE 28 – EXTERNAL VIEW OF FRONT OF DWELLING



PICTURE 29 – EXTERNAL VIEW OF REAR OF DWELLING



PICTURE 30 - EXTERNAL VIEW OF REAR OF DWELLING



PICTURE 31 - INTERNAL VIEW



PICTURE 33 - INTERNAL VIEW



PICTURE 35 - INTERNAL VIEW



PICTURE 32 – INTERNAL VIEW



PICTURE 34 - INTERNAL VIEW



PICTURE 36 – INTERNAL VIEW

3 Historical Overview

3.1 AREA HISTORY

Strathfield extends from Concord to the Cooks River. Part of the area was originally known as Liberty Plains, so called because the first free settlers received grants there. The Strathfield district was originally occupied by the Wangal Indigenous Australians tribe.

European settlement commenced in 1793 with the issue of land grants, one of which was 1000 acres to Thomas Rowley. Burwood derived its name from a grant of 250 acres made by Governor Hunter on 3 August 1799, to Captain Thomas Rowley of the New South Wales Corps, who named the land after the Burwood Farm on which he had lived in his native Cornwell, England in 1799. He acquired subsequent grants and brought it to 750 acres in total but he continued to live at Kingston Farm in Newtown until his death in 1806. He'd bought some of the first Spanish merinos brought from the Cape Colony in 1797, others being sold to Macarthur, Marsden & Cox. The southern boundary of his farm was approximately Woodside Avenue & Fitzroy Street.

Under Rowley's will the estate passed to his 3 underage children- executors Dr Harris & Major Johnstone were both involved in the 1808 Bligh rebellion and returned to England for the court martial. Governor Macquarie appointed Thomas Moore as guardian and executor. In 1812 he wrongfully auctioned the estate. It was bought by Sydney businessman Alexander Riley.²

Alexander Riley built the first house in the district, 'Burwood Villa' in 1814. Riley cleared and cultivated 500 acres of this land and he successfully introduced into the colony the orange, lemon, pomegranate, loquat, grape, peach, nectarine, apricot, apple, pear, cherry, plum, fig, chestnut, almond, mediar, quince, raspberry, strawberry and melon.



FIGURE 9 –LAND TITLES CONCORD PARISH MAP DATED WITHIN THE 1800S HOWEVER THE PORTION OF THE MAP SHOWING THE YEAR IS DAMAGED. THE APPROXIMATE SITE LOCATION IS INDICATED

SOURCE: LAND TITLES 2014.

² Dept Environment & Heritage. St Cloud and site 223 Burwood Rd SHR No. 00564

Many other land grants began the subdivision of the immediate area and gradually both Strathfield and Homebush began to develop as a residential district. Strathfield and Homebush were considered desirable places to live as the railway, which was first established in Homebush in 1855, enabled businessmen to travel to work into the city each day. As land was plentiful, many wealthy businessmen built lavish mansions on large blocks of land. Many of these homes still exist today such as 'Mount Royal' (Australian Catholic University), 'Brunyarra' and 'Lauriston' (Santa Maria Del Monte).³

By 1885, sufficient numbers of people resided in the district to enable incorporation of its own local government and in 1885, Strathfield Council was incorporated.





SOURCE: LAND TITLES DEPARTMENT NSW 2014.

On the 9th July 1876 a 'halt' where passengers flagged down the train was established at about the current site of Strathfield Station, known as 'Redmyre'. A year later platforms completed at this location. The suburb of Redmyre was renamed Strathfield c1886⁴ and Redmyre Station was renamed Strathfield at the request of Strathfield Council.

In the same year the number of platforms increased from 2 to 4 to serve the newly opened Strathfield-Hornsby Branch. A new station was open to the public in September 1901, but in 1927 it was completely rebuilt in the configuration as we know it today. In c1887-1914 allotments close to Strathfield railway station were advertised for sale.

Sir Daniel Cooper, a merchant and philanthropist from England He then owned extensive property in and around Sydney and held large stations in the western districts.⁵ He acquired the block on the southern side of Cooper Street (between Mosley Street and Wentworth Avenue) in 1889 and sold them off progressively to individual owners.

³ Strathfield Council. About Strathfield Subdivision and Development [electronic resource]

⁴ Strathfield Council. About Strathfield Subdivision and Development [electronic resource]

⁵ Australian Dictionary of Biography, *Sir Daniel Cooper (1821-1902),* <u>http://adb.anu.edu.au/biography/cooper-sir-daniel-3253</u>, accessed May 2016.

FIGURE 11 -HIGGINBOTHAM & ROBINSON SYDNEY SUBURBAN BOROUGH MAPS CONCORD 1890S



SOURCE: STATE LIBRARY OF NEW SOUTH WALES CALL NO F981.1/H.

FIGURE 12 - NEWSPAPER ADVERTISING SHOWS LAND IN COOPER STREET ON OFFER FROM 1887 TO 1914.

THE PROPERTY MARKET.

<section-header><text><text><text><text>

SOURCE: NATIONAL LIBRARY OF AUSTRALIA.

OWS LAND IN COOPER STREET ON OFF Dock, 160; block of land in Rhodes's Avenue, Wildoughby, 245; allotment, part of the Oatley Park Estate, 215; residence, fronting Padding-ton-street, 'Paddington, 21550; residence and land, fronting Albert Parade, AshBeld, 2100; small etty property, fronting Clarence-street, Darlingburst, land Oith by 1237, 2380; allotment of land, 20ft by 1207, 2380; allotment of land, 20ft by 1007, on the Old South Head-260; block of land, fronting Cooper-street, Strathfield, 2225 tiss 4d; allotment of land, ment of land, on the Wycombe Estate, fronting Boundary-street, Randwick, £56; two allotments, fronting Rhodes's Avenue, Willoughby (part of xpan's Estate), £109; and a parcel of Civil Ser-tice shares, averaging £4.48. Marrickville, £120; block of land, having 20ft frontage forod the Mount Errinston Estate, £110; broadstairs-street, Balmain, £60; Horaby purtion, block of land, in area about 1½ sere, portion of the Mount Errinston Estate, £110; block of land, having 50ft frontage to May-treet, Marrickville, 11% 60 foot frontage; portion of the Mount Errinston Estate, £110; block of land, fronting O'Hara-street, Marrickville, at Carrsford Estate, Hurstville, £10; two briefs blinbeth and Bediot streets, Strawberry Hills, fitabeth and Bediot streets, Strawberry block and Hara-street, Barnickville, and forming portion of the Mount Errinston state, £70; a parcel of shares in the Civil Service cooperative Society, at £4 7s dd and £4 10; princing 2030 acres freehold, 10,551 acres conditional firsteets, and States, New South Wales, and com-purchase, and States, New South Wales, and com-purchase, and States, New South Wales, and com-purchase, and States, New South Wales, and cow-purohase, and States,



SOURCE: STATE LIBRARY OF NEW SOUTH WALES A928681H.

The southern side of Cooper Street developed as a residential streetscape, of predominately single storey free-standing houses.

The sands directories indicate that in c1890, there were approximately two houses on the southern side of Cooper Street of which were developed by this time. By the following year, the southern side of the street had been well developed with at least six properties recorded. In 1895, residences on the southern side of the street were named "Taringha", "Allema", "Urangara", "Duntroon", Invermay" and "Haggerstone" and were constructed as Victorian villas and Federation cottages.

The 1943 aerial suggests the area to be well-developed by this time and Victorian villas and Federation cottages are present alongside some more contemporary development. Free-standing houses appear to stand on relatively large allotments, with established landscape settings and ancillary buildings to Cowdery laneway. From 1943, larger sites were progressively subdivided into battle-axe allotments. The streetscape has remained residential.



FIGURE 14 – 1943 AERIAL OF THE SOUTHERN SIDE OF COOPER STREET.

SOURCE: SIX VIEWER

3.2 SITE HISTORY

The following site history considers each of the three heritage listed properties located within the subject site, being 2 Cooper Street, 18A Cooper Street and 45 Wentworth Road, Strathfield.

3.2.1 2 COOPER STREET

The subject site was originally part of 750 acres (portion 246 of Parish) granted to Thomas Rowley by Crown Grant in 1803. Historic research indicates that residential subdivision of Sir Daniel Cooper's Paddock, which created Cooper Street, occurred in 1887, with *'Choice Allotments near Strathfield Station'* offered for sale. The site of 2 Cooper Street was identified as Lot 23 and Lot 24.

In 1888, William Deane, of Sydney, Solicitor, acquired the above mentioned allotments from Sir Daniel Cooper, who immediately sold the site to his eldest daughter Mary Constance Deane. Mary Constance Deane married Edward H Cowdery also in 1888.

The subject property first appears in the sands directories in 1890 as being occupied by Edward H. Cowdery. It is likely that Mary and Edward were responsible for developing the subject property with the present single storey Victorian gentleman's villa, which was called 'Taringa' of 'Taringha'. The sands directories indicate that the property was one of only two houses on the southern side of Cooper Street of which were developed at this time. By the following year, the southern side of the street had been well developed with at least six properties recorded.

Trove searches indicate that Cowdery was an authorised surveyor. He was president of the Institution of Surveyors, had been a member of the surveyor's board and worked in private practice in Sydney. It is also indicted in newspaper articles that his wife was a prominent Red Cross worker.

Cowdery is recorded as occupying the property throughout the sands directories up until 1932, but with the exception of the later years of the nineteenth century (1895 and 1896) when it is recorded as being occupied by Benjamin R Gelling and Arthur Verdon (it is assumed he was potentially renting the property in these years).

The subject site was subdivided from c1930, into lots 2, 2A and 2B. The dwelling constructed at 2A first appears in the sands directories in 1930.

The 1943 aerial indicates that the present dwelling is very intact. William Deane Cowdery (Edward and Marys son) inherited the property in 1950 and in that same year the property was sold to Daniel and Norman Norwood as joint tenants. The Cowderys occupied the site for approx. 62 years.

FIGURE 15 – HENRY COWDERY, HUSBAND OF MARY COWDERY, WHO ACQUIRED LOTS 23 AND 24 AND CONSTRUCTED THEIR HOME ON THE SITE IN C1888.



SOURCE: THE SYDNEY MORNING HERALD, 1923.

Cooper St 22 25 4 Lane 2.0At Wide One feat Res:

SOURCE: VOL 897/FOLIO 57.



SOURCE: SIX VIEWER

FIGURE 17 – 1986 IMAGE OF THE SUBJECT DWELLING



SOURCE: 1986 BURWOOD HERITAGE INVENTORY STUDY

3.2.2 18A COOPER STREET

The subject site was originally part of 750 acres (portion 246 of Parish) granted to Thomas Rowley by crown Grant in 1803. Historic research indicates that residential subdivision of Sir Daniel Cooper's Paddock, which created Cooper Street, occurred in 1887, with *'Choice Allotments near Strathfield Station'* offered for sale. The site of 18A Cooper Street was identified as Lot 9, Lot 10 and part of Lot 11.

Historic title searches indicate that the above mentioned allotments remained as vacant undeveloped land for some time following the 1887 subdivision. They passed through many owners before development first occurred on the site in 1939.

In 1929, Eric Norman Welch, of Strathfield, Bookmaker, acquired Lots 9-14 inclusive. Welch (1901-1983), was a successful race caller as well as a race horse owner. There is a biography for him on the Racing Victoria website⁶ and he appears in many trove searches.

In 1939, Welch sold some of the above mentioned allotments to George Michael Edward Vallance and Susannah Vallance as joint tenants, and retained Lot 9, Lot 10 and part of Lot 11 for the construction of his house, being the present dwelling. Original plans for the dwelling (called "Willawa") from Burwood Council records indicate that it was constructed in 1939. Welch acquired CR Wright (it is unknown whether he was an architect or draftsman) for the work, whose name appears on the plans, along with his office address at Haldon Street, Lakemba. Historic research does not uncover any additional information regarding Wright, nor any other buildings attributed to him. Welch and his wife occupied the site up until 1950 (approx 11 years).

The 1943 aerial shows an established and elaborate garden setting to the front and the rear of the dwelling and a rear ancillary structure to the lane. It is speculated that the landscaping was designed separately to the house.

In 1950, Albert George Simms, of Strathfield, Company Director, became the proprietor of the subject site. A plan at this time shows that the site had been subdivided into two separate allotments being Lot A and Lot B (with Lot B to the rear of the site).

In 1963, the site was sold to Trevor Vinson of Strathfield, Company Director and in 1966, the property was acquired by James Arthur Boyd of Strathfield, also a Company Director. A 1966 plan shows that by this time, the site is now identified as Lot 1 and Lot 2 and there is a new rear extension to the dwelling.

Shortly after the site was sold to Dominic Zappia of Five Dock, Director and Frances Zappia, his wife in 1969 (as joint tenants). The Zappias appear to have had an association with Ca'd'or Cinema (formerly Victory theatre) in Five Dock.

A development application (DA 183/2003), indicates that there were alterations and additions made to the dwelling c2005. The scope of work consisted of alterations and additions to the rear portion of the existing dwelling, a new rear roof form, the addition of a new rear wing to the dwelling and a new street fence. The roof of the rear bay was removed and the rear portion of ground floor level was reconstructed to blend into the new work.⁷

⁶ Racing Victoria, *Eric Welch (1901-1983),* accessed <u>https://rv.racing.com/careers-and-education/australian-racing-museum/hall-of-fame/associates/eric-welch,</u> May 2016.

⁷ Burwood Heritage Inventory Study, *18A Cooper Street*, 1986.

FIGURE 18 – ERIC NORMAN WELCH, WHO INITIALLY ACQUIRED LOTS 9-14 AND CONSTRUCTED HIS HOME AT 18A COOPER STREET IN 1939.





SOURCE: NATIONAL LIBRARY OF AUSTRALIA.

SOURCE: VOL 5032/FOL161

FIGURE 19 – 18A COOPER STREET, STRATHFIELD, ORIGINAL BUILDING PLANS, 1939.



SOURCE: BURWOOD CITY COUNCIL RECORDS



SOURCE: BURWOOD CITY COUNCIL RECORDS

FIGURE 20 – 1943 AERIAL SHOWING AN ESTABLISHED AND ELABORATE LANDSCAPE SETTING TO THE FRONT AND REAR OF THE DWELLING.



SOURCE: SIX VIEWER

FIGURE 21 – 1950 PLAN AND 1960 PLAN.





SOURCE: VOL 6244/FOL 68

FIGURE 22 - 1986 IMAGE OF THE SUBJECT DWELLING

SOURCE: 1986 BURWOOD HERITAGE INVENTORY STUDY

FIGURE 23 – DA 183/2003.



SOURCE: COUNCIL RECORDS, ACCESSED 2016.

3.2.3 45 WENTWORTH ROAD

The subject site was originally part of 750 acres (portion 246 of Parish) granted to Thomas Rowley by crown Grant in 1803. Historic research indicates that residential subdivision of Sir Daniel Cooper's Paddock, which created Cooper Street, occurred in 1887, with *'Choice Allotments near Strathfield Station'* offered for sale. The site of 45 Wentworth Road was identified as part Lot 27, Lot 28 and Lot 29.

In 1894, Ellen Halley of Sydney, Spinster acquired the subject site from Sir Daniel Cooper and immediately took out a mortgage (from c1894-1905). It is likely that Halley was responsible for the construction of the subject dwelling, being a free-standing two-storey brick Victorian villa. The subject dwelling first appears in the sand directories in 1896 and is occupied by Miss Annie Halley with the residence called "Croft Willock".

In 1929, Halley became the proprietor of the site in an "undivided moiety or half share". In 1944, Annie Stuart Macdonald, Spinster and Norman Charles MacDonald, Engineer, of Balgowlah, became the registered proprietors of the undivided moiety of the land as joint tenants. In 1954, the site was sold to Francis John Membrey and Frank Henry as joint tenants and then in 1960, Francis Scott Daly, of Croydon, Estate Agent, acquired the now battle-axe subdivided site, being Lot B at this stage.

In 1962, Joseph Dann, of Campsie, Machinist, became the proprietor of the subject site and shortly after in 1965, Michael Dann became the proprietor of the subject site.

The subject site is currently operating as a boarding house. A Development Application has recently been approved in 2014 for a new contemporary addition to the south-western façade of the dwelling. The dwelling is largely intact. According to the heritage report submitted by Rappaport Heritage Consultants in support of the DA, the property has had the following external and internal alterations and additions:

- painting of the southern façade;
- new service wing/weatherboard additions to the rear;
- replacement of original veranda posts on the upper level with timber posts;
- new Victorian period railings on the lower level with brick columns and low walls;
- enclosure of the north facing portion of the two storey wrap around balcony;
- non-original roof tiles and removal of chimneys; and
- internal adaption of the dwelling for boarding house use including removal of fireplaces, insertion
 of new walls, alterations to ceiling and cornices and new kitchen and bathroom fitouts.



SOURCE:VOL 4332/FOL 73.

FIGURE 24 - 1929 AND 1960 PLAN

SOURCE: VOL 8057/FOL 123.

FIGURE 25 – 1943 AERIAL SHOWING THE SUBJECT DWELLING OCCUPYING THE ENTIRE CORNER SITE.



SOURCE: SIX VIEWER.

FIGURE 26 – RECENTLY APPROVED REAR ADDITION TO THE SUBJECT DWELLING.



SOURCE: COUNCIL RECORDS (IMAGE PREPARED BY INTEGRATED DESIGN GROUP), ACCESSED 2016.

FIGURE 27 - THE SUBJECT DWELLING 1986



SOURCE: 1986 BURWOOD HERITAGE INVENTORY STUDY

3.3 DATES OF CONSTRUCTION

Historic research suggests the following dates of construction for the 3 heritage listed items:

- 2 Cooper Street, Strathfield was constructed by 1890.
- 18A Cooper Street, Strathfield was constructed by 1939.
- 45 Wentworth Street, Strathfield was constructed by 1896.

4 Comparative Analysis—18A Cooper Street, Strathfield

4.1 COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS TABLE

The below comparison considers comparable Functionalist style dwellings of the Inter War period for the purposes of establishing rarity or integrity and comparative value of 18A Cooper Street, Strathfield. Note that physical description and statement of significance information is sourced from the NSW Office of Environment and Heritage database inventory forms for each example. In addition to this, images are sourced from google earth.

The following comparison considers dwellings in suburban Sydney areas, as well as an example from Cooks Hill, Newcastle. Generally, these dwellings have been constructed by a variety of architecture practices. Whilst the subject dwelling has been attributed to CR Wright, historical research has not uncovered any additional dwellings or buildings which have been attributed to him and therefore this comparison has not considered any other examples of his works.

TABLE 1 – COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

SITE	PHYSICAL DESCRIPTION & HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE	IMAGES
House—1 Walker Avenue, Mascot Botany Bay Local Environment Plan (LEP) 2013 (Local item 1166) Constructed: 1926-1950 Architect/Designer: Unknown	 Physical Description A single storey face brick dwelling with a symmetrical front façade, a rounded entrance and a hipped roof concealed by a front parapet. The roof features multi-coloured concrete tiles. The site also features an intact face brick front fence. Statement of Significance This dwelling has local historic and aesthetic significance as a Representative and intact example of the Inter War Period Functionalist Style. 	
House—147 Bay Street, Botany Bay Botany Bay Local Environment Plan (LEP) 2013 (Local item I20) Constructed: 1926-1950 Architect/Designer: Unknown	 Physical Description A single storey face brick dwelling with a symmetrical front façade, a rounded entrance and a hipped roof concealed by a front parapet. The roof features multi-coloured concrete tiles. The front façade features original stained glass windows. The site also features an intact face brick front fence. Statement of Significance This dwelling has local historic and aesthetic significance as a Representative and intact example of the Inter War Period Functionalist Style. 	

SITE	PHYSICAL DESCRIPTION & HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE	IMAGES
House—18 Beach Road, Collaroy Warringah Local Environment Plan (LEP) 2011 (Local item 17) Constructed: 1938 Architect/Designer: Brewster & Manderson (Builder was H.F.Gascoigne).	 Physical Description A 2-3 storey face brick dwelling with hipped cement tiled roof. Semicircular bay to front elevation with continuous bands of steel-framed casement windows. Curved feature on side with vertical glass blocks, enclosing stairwell. It was built in 1938 to a design by Brewster & Manderson. The builder was H.F Gascoigne. At the time of its construction, it was published as an important "modern" residence. Statement of Significance A representative example of a substantial inter-war functionalist dwelling with idiosyncratic detailing. Displays good integrity of fabric. Historically it was "an important modern building" when constructed & indicates the use of architects in home design. 	
House—5 The Boulevard, Cammeray North Sydney Local Environment Plan (LEP) 2011 (Local item 10020) Constructed: 1915-1940 Architect/Designer: Ernest Maxwell Osborn (LM-CP)	 Physical Description One and a half storey brick house with flat roof, sited on hillside with lower floor entry to main upper floor. Asymmetric, with projecting semi-circular bay, flat roofed corner verandah, steel framed windows returning around corners in continuous horizontal strips, a vertical band of glass bricks and the whole is approached by a rising stair enveloped by curving balustrades of random coursed rusticated ashlar sandstone. A matching rusticated ashlar sandstone garage is sited at street level. This building is designed in the Inter-War Functionalist style There is a small garden to front terraced with low sandstone walls. Statement of Significance A Rare example locally of International/Functionalist style architecture in a dramatic setting. A fine example of the style and possibly the most exemplary in the municipality in a domestic form. 	
SITE	PHYSICAL DESCRIPTION & HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE	IMAGES
---	---	--------
SITE House—99 Yarranabee Road, Darling Point Woollahra Local Environment Plan (LEP) 2014 (Local item 194) Constructed: 1938 Architect/Designer: John Athelstan Victor Nisbet, Architect.	PHYSICAL DESCRIPTION & HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE Physical Description The house is a small symmetrical two storey face brick building in the Inter War Functionalist style. The main two storey mass is roughly square in shape, set at a diagonal to the main north-south side boundaries. Images suggest it has a mansard roof addition. The front entrance to the house is through the southern curved corner at ground floor level, and is approached via a short flight of curved steps in contrasting brickwork. The house appears to retain its original pattern of window openings, which are distributed in a symmetrical fashion to each of the elevations, and feature soldier courses over the lintels. Windows are steel or timber framed casements.	
	Casements. Statement of Significance The house at 99 Yarranabbe Road has high local historic and aesthetic significance as a demonstrated, although not documented, copy of international architect Wells Coates' "Sunspan" house, exhibited in England, and which is rare in Sydney.	
	The house has local historical significance as a representative example of the emergence of Inter War housing development at the northern end of Darling Point. The house has some local historical significance as a demonstrative example of the emergence and direct influence of the International modern architectural movement within Sydney in the late 1930s, through the publishing of works in professional journals.	
	The house has streetscape value on Yarranabbe Road, for its prominent site location and strong architectural character, which is typical of its Functionalist style, and which affords it sculptural like qualities.	

SITE	PHYSICAL DESCRIPTION & HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE	IMAGES
Residence—79 Parkway Avenue, Cooks Hill Newcastle Newcastle Local Environment Plan (LEP) 2012 (Local item 194) Constructed: 1938-1939 Architect/Designer: by F.Fryer (Builder)	 Physical Description A modest two storey residence, constructed of face brickwork which remains unpainted with a low pitched roof concealed by a parapet. The design is in the Inter-War Functionalist style, including many typical details of that style such as the curved corners, horizontal emphasis in the brickwork and the windows, a tower element, and wrought iron balustrades. A low brick wall matching the style of the house runs around both street frontages. The only prominent landscaping is the hedged shrubs inside the garden wall, though these may not be original. The room above the garage appears to be an addition though is sympathetic to the original and was probably constructed not long afterwards. Statement of Significance The residence at 79 Parkway Avenue is significant as a prominent element within the streetscape. It is a good example of the Inter-war Functionalist style, and a relatively rare one surviving largely intact. It is typical of the high quality residential development expected in the Hamilton Garden suburb, and one of the few two storey buildings in the area, most of which are on Parkway Ave. 	
House—6 Lavoni Street, Mosman Mosman Local Environment Plan (LEP) 2012 (Local item I129) Constructed: c1915-1940 Architect/Designer: Unknown	 Physical Description A two storey Inter-War Functionalist style house that is of a relatively simple form, but is thoroughly detailed and well maintained. Set back from the street, an open grassed front yard is enclosed by exotic tree species typical of the Inter-War period. The building is painted rendered brickwork with a green tile roof. The plan form steps back in three steps from the forward semi-circular wing. This wing, which projects through the eaves line, includes horizontal bands of metal framed windows with curved glass, the upper and lower panes of which are obscure glass. 	

SITE	PHYSICAL DESCRIPTION & HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE	IMAGES
	The second step in plan includes the entry with stone steps. This step in plan form provides a vertical visual emphasis whilst the windows and thin concrete hood over the windows provides a more horizontal emphasis.	
	Statement of Significance	
	A good representative example of an Inter-War Functionalist House. Its setting, intactness and competently executed details contribute to its significance.	
House—1071 Pittwater Road, Collaroy	Physical Description	
Warringah Local Environment Plan (LEP) 2011 (Local item I21) Constructed: c1915-1940 Architect/Designer: Unknown	A substantial two storey, rendered masonry dwelling on corner site. High parapet. Curved corners & strong horizontal cantilevered hoods over windows on both levels. Porthole window. Metal balustrade to 1st floor balcony. Statement of Significance A highly representative example of a substantial inter-war functionalist dwelling. High integrity with much original fabric. Historically provides evidence of the development of larger houses in this period, particularly near the beach. A Landmark corner site.	

4.1.1 COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS SUMMARY

The above comparative analysis has compared a number of examples of Inter War Period Functionalist Style dwellings in suburban Sydney areas, as well as an example from Cooks Hill, Newcastle. Overall, this comparative analysis has demonstrated the following findings:

- There are many examples of Local heritage listed dwellings of the Inter War period Functionalist Style in suburban Sydney areas, as well as interstate.
- All examples portray characteristics of the style; however, better examples of the style are architect designed.
- Most retain relatively intact garden settings.

The style came out of an International modernist movement and was popular but produced a number of examples which were not particularly refined, as they were "copying" a modern style, rather than demonstrating a strong understanding of the signature characteristics of the Functionalist style, such as an overall streamlined character achieved through curved corners and geometric shapes, horizontal bands of fenestration and spandrel balconies, asymmetric massing, large glass areas and parapeted forms with concealed roofs. Many of the less refined examples also blend with elements of the Art Deco style.

Exemplars of the style are demonstrated by 99 Yarranbee Road, Darling Point and 18 Beach Road, Collaroy which are architect designed and although modified (i.e. roof additions), they demonstrate high aesthetic and technical significance, with sculptural like qualities and which contribute to the streetscape. The example demonstrated by 1 Walker Avenue, Mascot is perhaps the least refined as it does not demonstrate the breadth of characteristics of the Functionalist style as do the other examples, i.e. with its symmetrical front façade and hipped roof form.

The subject dwelling although demonstrating some characteristics of the style, presents as a less refined example than the architect designed examples which illustrate a clearer understanding of the typology. It would be considered Contributory if it formed part of a large Inter War period heritage conservation area, but it is not considered to reach the threshold for individual listing.

5 Heritage Significance

5.1 WHAT IS HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE?

Before making decisions to change a heritage item, an item within a heritage conservation area, or an item located in proximity to a heritage listed item, it is important to understand its values and the values of its context. This leads to decisions that will retain these values in the future. Statements of heritage significance summarise a place's heritage values–why it is important, why a statutory listing was made to protect these values.

The Heritage Council of NSW has developed a set of seven criteria for assessing heritage significance, which can be used to make decisions about the heritage value of a place or item. There are two levels of heritage significance used in NSW: state and local.

The following assessment of heritage significance has been prepared in accordance with the 'Assessing Heritage Significance' (2001) guides.

5.2 SIGNIFICANCE ASSESSMENT—2 COOPER STREET, STRATHFIELD

CRITERIA	SIGNIFICANCE ASSESSMENT
A – Historical Significance An item is important in the course or pattern of the local area's cultural or natural history.	 The subject site is a comparatively intact and representative example of a Victorian villa constructed during one of the earliest phases of development in Strathfield (c1860s-1890s), during a period of affluence and economic prosperity, which resulted in the construction of substantial Victorian homes and gardens. The subject site meets the threshold for Local heritage listing for Historical Significance.
Guidelines for Inclusion • shows evidence of a significant human activity is associated with a significant activity or historical phase • maintains or shows the continuity of a historical process or activity	Guidelines for Exclusion • has incidental or unsubstantiated connections with historically important activities or processes • provides evidence of activities or processes that are of dubious historical importance • has been so altered that it can no longer provide evidence of a particular association
B – Associative Significance An item has strong or special associations with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in the local area's cultural or natural history.	 The subject site has an association as the residence of Edward H. Cowdery, an authorised Surveyor. He was relatively well-known and was president of the Institution of Surveyors, had been a member of the surveyor's board and worked in private practice in Sydney. The family were residents of the property for over 60 years. His associational significance is likely recognised in the local area with Cowdery Lane named after him. The architect or designer of the dwelling is unknown. Although there is an association with Edward H. Cowdery, the subject site does not reach the threshold

CRITERIA	SIGNIFICANCE ASSESSMENT
	for Local heritage listing for Associative Significance.
Guidelines for Inclusion shows evidence of a significant human occupation is associated with a significant event, person, or group of persons	Guidelines for Exclusion • has incidental or unsubstantiated connections with historically important people or events > provides evidence of people or events that are of dubious historical importance • has been so altered that it can no longer provide evidence of a particular association
C – Aesthetic Significance An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in the local area.	 Although currently vacant and in a derelict condition, it is a comparatively intact and fine example of a larger Victorian 'gentlemans' villa in the Italianate style with significant features including the principal façade bays and verandahs. The subject site meets the threshold for Local heritage listing for Aesthetic Significance.
Guidelines for Inclusion shows or is associated with, creative or technical innovation or achievement is the inspiration for a creative or technical innovation or achievement is aesthetically distinctive has landmark qualities exemplifies a particular taste, style or technology	Guidelines for Exclusion • is not a major work by an important designer or artist • has lost its design or technical integrity • its positive visual or sensory appeal or landmark and scenic qualities have been more than temporarily degraded • has only a loose association with a creative or technical achievement
D – Social Significance An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in the local area for social, cultural or spiritual reasons.	 Historical research of the subject site does not reveal any significant community or special associations of note. The subject site does not reach the threshold for Local heritage listing for Social Significance.
Guidelines for Inclusion • is important for its associations with an identifiable group □ • is important to a community's sense of place	Guidelines for Exclusion • is only important to the community for amenity reasons ∞ • is retained only in preference to a proposed alternative
E – Research Potential An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of the local area's cultural or natural history.	 The subject site is an important benchmark or reference site as a comparatively intact "larger" example of a Victorian "gentleman's villa" in the LGA. The subject site meets the threshold for Local heritage listing for Research Potential
Guidelines for Inclusion • has the potential to yield new or further substantial scientific and/or archaeological information • is an important benchmark or reference site or type • provides evidence of past human cultures	Guidelines for Exclusion • the knowledge gained would be irrelevant to research on science, human history or culture • has little archaeological or research potential • only contains information that is readily available from other resources or archaeological sites

CRITERIA		SIGNIFICANCE ASSESSMENT
that is unavailable elsewhere		
F – Rarity An item possesses uncommon, rare or end aspects of the local area's cultural or natur	-	 The subject site is not rare; the typology is common for the period and there are surviving examples extant within the LGA and broader Sydney metropolitan areas. The subject site does not meet the threshold for Local heritage listing for Rarity.
 Guidelines for Inclusion provides evidence of a defunct custom, way of life or process demonstrates a process, custom or other human activity that is in danger of being lost shows unusually accurate evidence of a significant human activity is the only example of its type demonstrates designs or techniques of exceptional interest shows rare evidence of a significant human activity important to a community 		Guidelines for Exclusion is not rare is numerous but under threat
 G - Representative An item is important in demonstrating the p characteristics of a class of NSWs (or the l cultural or natural places; or cultural or natural environments. 	-	 Although the dwelling is in a derelict state; it is a comparatively intact and representative example of a late nineteenth century Victorian villa in the LGA. The subject site meets the threshold for Local heritage listing for Representative.
 Guidelines for Inclusion is a fine example of its type has the principal characteristics of an important class or group of items has attributes typical of a particular way of life, philosophy, custom, significant process, design, technique or activity is a significant variation to a class of items is part of a group which collectively illustrates a representative type is outstanding because of its setting, condition or size is outstanding because of its integrity or the esteem in which it is held 		Guidelines for Exclusion • is a poor example of its type • does not include or has lost the range of characteristics of a type • does not represent well the characteristics that make up a significant variation of a type

5.2.1 STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE—2 COOPER STREET, STRATHFIELD

Number 2 Cooper Street, Strathfield, is of Local heritage significance for historic, aesthetic, representative and research value.

Historically, it is a comparatively intact and representative example of a Victorian "gentleman's villa", constructed during one of the earliest phases of development in Strathfield (c1860s-1890s), which was a period of affluence and economic prosperity.

Aesthetically, it has characteristics of the Italianate style with significant features including the principal façade bays and verandahs. It comprises of research potential as an important benchmark or reference site in the LGA, as a larger and fine example of a "gentleman's villa".

5.3 SIGNIFICANCE ASSESSMENT—45 WENTWORTH ROAD, STRATHFIELD

CRITERIA	SIGNIFICANCE ASSESSMENT
A – Historical Significance An item is important in the course or pattern of the local area's cultural or natural history.	 The subject site is a fine example of substantial late nineteenth dwelling demonstrating elements of Victorian and Federation styles. It was constructed at the turning point from the late Victorian period to early Federation period and is representative of late 19th century development in Strathfield The subject site meets the threshold for Local heritage listing for Historical Significance.
Guidelines for Inclusion shows evidence of a significant human activity ☑ is associated with a significant activity or historical phase ☑ maintains or shows the continuity of a historical process or activity	Guidelines for Exclusion has incidental or unsubstantiated connections with historically important activities or processes provides evidence of activities or processes that are of dubious historical importance has been so altered that it can no longer provide evidence of a particular association
B – Associative Significance An item has strong or special associations with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in the local area's cultural or natural history.	 Historical research of the subject site does not reveal any significant associations of note. The architect or designer of the dwelling is unknown. The subject site does not reach the threshold for Local heritage listing for Associative Significance.
Guidelines for Inclusion shows evidence of a significant human occupation is associated with a significant event, person, or group of persons	Guidelines for Exclusion • has incidental or unsubstantiated connections with historically important people or events • provides evidence of people or events that are of dubious historical importance • has been so altered that it can no longer provide evidence of a particular association
C – Aesthetic Significance An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in the local area.	 The subject site is a fine example of a substantial late nineteenth century dwelling, with elements of Victorian and Federation Styles (albeit with some more contemporary alterations and additions). The subject site has landmark qualities in the

CRITERIA	SIGNIFICANCE ASSESSMENT
	streetscape, as a substantial dwelling and garden located on a corner allotment. The subject site meets the threshold for Local heritage listing for Aesthetic Significance.
Guidelines for Inclusion • shows or is associated with, creative or technical innovation or achievement • is the inspiration for a creative or technical innovation or achievement • is aesthetically distinctive • has landmark qualities • exemplifies a particular taste, style or technology • D – Social Significance An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in the local area for social, cultural or spiritual reasons.	Guidelines for Exclusion • is not a major work by an important designer or artist • has lost its design or technical integrity • its positive visual or sensory appeal or landmark and scenic qualities have been more than temporarily degraded • has only a loose association with a creative or technical achievement • Historical research of the subject site does not reveal any significant community or special associations of note. The subject site does not reach the threshold for Local heritage listing for Social Significance.
Guidelines for Inclusion is important for its associations with an identifiable group is important to a community's sense of place	Guidelines for Exclusion • is only important to the community for amenity reasons • is retained only in preference to a proposed alternative
E – Research Potential An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of the local area's cultural or natural history.	 The subject site is an important benchmark or reference site in the LGA as a fine example of late nineteenth century dwelling, which combines both Victorian and Federation architecture. The subject site meets the threshold for Local heritage listing for Research Potential.
Guidelines for Inclusion has the potential to yield new or further substantial scientific and/or archaeological information □ is an important benchmark or reference site or type provides evidence of past human cultures that is unavailable elsewhere	Guidelines for Exclusion • the knowledge gained would be irrelevant to research on science, human history or culture • has little archaeological or research potential • only contains information that is readily available from other resources or archaeological sites
F – Rarity An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of the local area's cultural or natural history.	• Although the subject site is distinctive it is not rare. The subject site does not meet the threshold for Local heritage listing for Rarity.
Guidelines for Inclusion • provides evidence of a defunct custom, way of life or process □ • demonstrates a process, custom or other human activity that is in danger of being lost □ • shows unusually accurate evidence of a	Guidelines for Exclusion • is not rare ⊠ • is numerous but under threat □

CRITERIA		SIGNIFICANCE ASSESSMENT	
 significant human activity is the only example of its type demonstrates designs or techniques of exceptional interest shows rare evidence of a significant human activity important to a community 			
 G - Representative An item is important in demonstrating the characteristics of a class of NSWs (or the area's): cultural or natural places; or cultural or natural environments. 		 The subject site has representative value as example of late 19h century housing. The subject site meets the threshold for Local he listing for Representative. 	
Guidelines for Inclusion		Guidelines for Exclusion	
 is a fine example of its type 		 is a poor example of its type 	
 has the principal characteristics of an important class or group of items 		 does not include or has lost the range of characteristics of a type 	
 has attributes typical of a particular way of life, philosophy, custom, significant process, design, technique or activity is a significant variation to a class of items is part of a group which collectively illustrates a representative type is outstanding because of its setting, 		 does not represent well the characteristics that make up a significant variation of a type 	
 condition or size is outstanding because of its integrity or the esteem in which it is held 	\boxtimes		

5.3.1 STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE—45 WENTWORTH ROAD, STRATHFIELD

Number 45 Wentworth Road, Strathfield, is of Local heritage significance for historic, aesthetic, representative and research value.

Historically, the subject site is a fine example of a substantial late nineteenth century dwelling, constructed during one of the earliest phases of development in Strathfield (c1860s-1890s), which was a period of affluence and economic prosperity.

Aesthetically, it is distinctive and demonstrates elements of the Victorian and Federation styles. It has research potential as an important benchmark or reference site in the LGA

5.4 SIGNIFICANCE ASSESSMENT—18A COOPER STREET, STRATHFIELD

CRITERIA	SIGNIFICANCE ASSESSMENT
A – Historical Significance An item is important in the course or pattern of the local area's cultural or natural history.	 The subject site is an example of a late inter-war period dwelling. In its immediate locality it reflects a further inter-war subdivision in an area characterised by largely Victorian subdivision and development. Whilst inter-war development is a significant development phase in the LGA, there are other more consistent examples and groups of Inter-war period housing in the locality.

CRITERIA	SIGNIFICANCE ASSESSMENT
	heritage listing for Historical Significance.
Guidelines for Inclusion shows evidence of a significant human activity is associated with a significant activity or historical phase maintains or shows the continuity of a historical process or activity	Guidelines for Exclusion • has incidental or unsubstantiated connections with historically important activities or processes • provides evidence of activities or processes that are of dubious historical importance • has been so altered that it can no longer provide evidence of a particular association
B – Associative Significance An item has strong or special associations with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in the local area's cultural or natural history.	 The subject site has an association with Eric Norman Welch, for whom the house was built. He was a successful Bookmaker, race caller and race horse owner. There is a biography for him on the Racing Victoria website.⁸ The dwelling was designed by and has an association with CR Wright; however, it is unknown whether he was an architect or draftsman and historic research did not uncover any other works attributed to him. Despite the noted associations, the subject site is not considered to reach the threshold for Local heritage listing for Associative Significance.
Guidelines for Inclusion • shows evidence of a significant human occupation • is associated with a significant event, person, or group of persons	Guidelines for Exclusion • has incidental or unsubstantiated connections with historically important people or events • provides evidence of people or events that are of dubious historical importance • has been so altered that it can no longer provide evidence of a particular association
C – Aesthetic Significance An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in the local area.	 Although the subject site is relatively intact (albeit with some alterations and additions at the rear), it presents as a comparatively stripped example and is not a refined example of the Functionalist typology. The subject site does not reach the threshold for Local heritage listing for Aesthetic Significance.
Guidelines for Inclusion shows or is associated with, creative or technical innovation or achievement is the inspiration for a creative or technical innovation or achievement is aesthetically distinctive has landmark qualities exemplifies a particular taste, style or technology	Guidelines for Exclusion • is not a major work by an important designer or artist • has lost its design or technical integrity • its positive visual or sensory appeal or landmark and scenic qualities have been more than temporarily degraded • has only a loose association with a creative or technical achievement

⁸ Racing Victoria, *Eric Welch (1901-1983),* accessed <u>https://rv.racing.com/careers-and-education/australian-racing-museum/hall-of-fame/associates/eric-welch,</u> May 2016.

CRITERIA	SIGNIFICANCE ASSESSMENT
D – Social Significance An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in the local area for social, cultural or spiritual reasons.	 Historical research of the subject site does not reveal any significant community or special associations of note. The subject site does not reach the threshold for Local heritage listing for Social Significance.
Guidelines for Inclusion • is important for its associations with an identifiable group □ • is important to a community's sense of place	Guidelines for Exclusion • is only important to the community for amenity reasons • is retained only in preference to a proposed alternative
E – Research Potential An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of the local area's cultural or natural history.	 The subject site is unlikely to reveal any information that will contribute to late 1930s construction techniques not readily available elsewhere. European archaeological potential is considered low as there is no evidence of previous occupation of the site. The subject site does not reach the threshold for Local heritage listing for Research Potential.
Guidelines for Inclusion has the potential to yield new or further substantial scientific and/or archaeological information is an important benchmark or reference site or type provides evidence of past human cultures that is unavailable elsewhere	Guidelines for Exclusion • the knowledge gained would be irrelevant to research on science, human history or culture • has little archaeological or research potential • only contains information that is readily available from other resources or archaeological sites
F – Rarity An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of the local area's cultural or natural history.	 The subject site is not rare. There are many 'better and more representative' examples of Inter-War period housing as demonstrated in the below comparative analysis. The subject site does not reach the threshold for Local heritage listing for Rarity.
Guidelines for Inclusion provides evidence of a defunct custom, way of life or process demonstrates a process, custom or other human activity that is in danger of being lost shows unusually accurate evidence of a significant human activity is the only example of its type demonstrates designs or techniques of exceptional interest shows rare evidence of a significant human activity important to a community	Guidelines for Exclusion is not rare is numerous but under threat
G – Representative An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSWs (or the local	• Although the subject site has some representative value as Inter War period development, it is not considered a refined example of its typology.

CRITERIA		SIGNIFICANCE ASSESSMENT	
area's): cultural or natural places; or cultural or natural environments.		The subject site does not meet the threshold for Local heritage listing for Representative.	
Guidelines for Inclusion		Guidelines for Exclusion	
 is a fine example of its type 		 is a poor example of its type 	
 has the principal characteristics of an important class or group of items 		 does not include or has lost the range of characteristics of a type 	\boxtimes
 has attributes typical of a particular way of life, philosophy, custom, significant process, design, technique or activity 		 does not represent well the characteristics that make up a significant variation of a type 	\boxtimes
 is a significant variation to a class of items 			
 is part of a group which collectively illustrates a representative type 			
 is outstanding because of its setting, condition or size 			
 is outstanding because of its integrity or the esteem in which it is held 			

5.4.1 STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE—18A COOPER STREET, STRATHFIELD

Number 18A Cooper Street, Strathfield, does not reach the threshold for Local heritage significance.

Although it has some historic value and demonstrates some characteristics of the Inter War Functionalist Style, it does not form part of a consistent setting/group of Inter War period housing in the locality and it presents as a less refined example of its typology.

6 Opportunities and Constraints

6.1 HERITAGE LEGISLATION

FIGURE 28 – THE SUBJECT BLOCK COMPRISING OF 3 HERITAGE LISTED ITEMS AND LOCATED OPPOSITE TWO DESIGNATED HCAS.



SOURCE: BURWOOD LEP 2012 HERITAGE MAP

6.2 OPPORTUNITIES

- The subject block is located in the transition zone between the "Mosely and Roberts Streets Heritage Conservation Area" (item C15) and the "Philip Street Heritage Conservation Area" (item C16), and the residential flat development in Everton Road Burwood. Everton Street adjoins the western railway line and Strathfield Railway Station.
- Due to the condition of many of the dwellings in the block between Cooper Street and Cowdery Lane it is not included in a conservation area.
- There is the opportunity to provide increased density near Strathfield Railway Station within the confines of the dwellings of assessed heritage significance.
- The Listed heritage dwelling at 18A Cooper Street has been determined as being in a poor structural condition and it conservation is not considered warranted based on its significance and condition.
- There is the opportunity to increase the density of residential development on the block whilst maintaining the significant items and their setting.

6.3 CONSTRAINTS

- There are three listed heritage dwellings and a substation (Section 170 register) on the subject block.
- The site is adjacent to two conservation areas.
- There are 5 dwellings within the conservation areas that front Cooper Street in the subject block.
- The settings of the heritage items to be retained are to be respected by appropriate heights and setbacks for new development.
- The retained heritage items are to be conserved and restored to an appropriate standard.
- Any new development connected to the heritage items to be retained shall be of a nature that does not impact on significance fabric and is appropriate in design.
- Any new development adjacent to the heritage items to be retained shall not diminish the setting of the item.

7 Conclusion and Recommendations

This assessment concludes that the dwellings at 45 Wentworth Road and 2 Cooper Street should be conserved, along with the substation in Cooper Street, listed on the S170 Register.

The demolition of the dwelling house located at 18A Cooper Street, Strathfield is supported on heritage grounds, as this report has found that it does not meet the threshold for Local heritage listing and is therefore not required to be retained. In addition to this, the structural report prepared by United Consulting Engineers Pty Ltd has determined that the condition of is poor and will soon require substantial remedial works to mitigate concrete cancer, which may require substantial reconstruction of the principal northern façade. The significance of the building is currently vested in its primary façade and form and reconstruction of this would diminish its significance.

8 Bibliography and References

8.1 BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Department of Lands 2011, Spatial Information eXchange, Department of Lands, Sydney, available at: .
- Google Maps 2011, Aerial view of subject site, available at: http://maps.google.com.au/maps?hl=en&tab=wl.
- NSW Roads and Traffic Authority 2005, From the Skies: Aerial photographs of Sydney in 1943, CD-ROM, NSW Roads and Traffic Authority, Surry Hills.
- Racing Victoria, *Eric Welch (1901-1983)*, accessed <u>https://rv.racing.com/careers-and-</u> education/australian-racing-museum/hall-of-fame/associates/eric-welch, May 2016.
- RP Data 2011, Property Information search of subject site, available at: http://www.rpdata.net.au/.
- Strathfield Council. About Strathfield Subdivision and Development [electronic resource]
- Telstra Corporation 2011, *WhereiS.com*, Digital Maps, Telstra Corporation, available at: http://www.whereis.com/whereis/map.do>.

United Consulting Engineers Pty Ltd, Structural Report—18A Cooper Street, Strathfield, May 2016.

8.2 REFERENCES

- Apperly, R., Irving, R. and Reynolds, P. (eds) 2002, *A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture: Styles and Terms from 1788 to the Present*, Angus and Robertson, Pymble.
- Australia ICOMOS 1999, The Burra Charter: 2013 The Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance, Australia ICOMOS, Burwood.
- Australian Dictionary of Biography, Sir Daniel Cooper (1821-1902), http://adb.anu.edu.au/biography/cooper-sir-daniel-3253, accessed May 2016.

Burwood Heritage Inventory Study, 18A Cooper Street, 1986.

Heritage Office and Department of Urban Affairs & Planning 1996, *NSW Heritage Manual*, Heritage Office and Department of Urban Affairs & Planning (NSW), Sydney.

Heritage Office 2001, Assessing Heritage Significance, Heritage Office, Parramatta.

[Note: Some government departments have changed their names over time and the above publications state the name at the time of publication.]

Disclaimer

This report is dated July 2016 and incorporates information and events up to that date only and excludes any information arising, or event occurring, after that date which may affect the validity of Urbis Pty Ltd's (**Urbis**) opinion in this report. Urbis prepared this report on the instructions, and for the benefit only, of the residents on the south side of Cooper Street (**Instructing Party**) for the purpose of Heritage Impact Statement (**Purpose**) and not for any other purpose or use. To the extent permitted by applicable law, Urbis expressly disclaims all liability, whether direct or indirect, to the Instructing Party which relies or purports to rely on this report for any purpose other than the Purpose, and to any other person which relies or purports to rely on this report for any purpose whatsoever (including the Purpose).

In preparing this report, Urbis was required to make judgements which may be affected by unforeseen future events, the likelihood and effects of which are not capable of precise assessment.

All surveys, forecasts, projections and recommendations contained in or associated with this report are made in good faith and on the basis of information supplied to Urbis at the date of this report, and upon which Urbis relied. Achievement of the projections and budgets set out in this report will depend, among other things, on the actions of others over which Urbis has no control.

In preparing this report, Urbis may rely on or refer to documents in a language other than English, which Urbis may arrange to be translated. Urbis is not responsible for the accuracy or completeness of such translations and disclaims any liability for any statement or opinion made in this report being inaccurate or incomplete arising from such translations.

Whilst Urbis has made all reasonable inquiries it believes necessary in preparing this report, it is not responsible for determining the completeness or accuracy of information provided to it. Urbis (including its officers and personnel) is not liable for any errors or omissions, including in information provided by the Instructing Party or another person or upon which Urbis relies, provided that such errors or omissions are not made by Urbis recklessly or in bad faith.

This report has been prepared with due care and diligence by Urbis and the statements and opinions given by Urbis in this report are given in good faith and in the reasonable belief that they are correct and not misleading, subject to the limitations above.

Sydney Tower 2, Level 23, Darling Park 201 Sussex Street Sydney, NSW 2000 t +02 8233 9900 f +02 8233 9966

Melbourne

Level 12, 120 Collins Street Melbourne, VIC 3000 t +03 8663 4888 f +03 8663 4999

Brisbane

Level 7, 123 Albert Street Brisbane, QLD 4000 t +07 3007 3800 f +07 3007 3811

Perth

Level 1, 55 St Georges Terrace Perth, WA 6000 t +08 9346 0500 f +08 9221 1779

Australia • Asia • Middle East w urbis.com.au e info@urbis.com.au